

Influence of Workload on Job Performance Among Secondary School Teachers in Southwest, Nigeria

Queen Agbamorin EMIKPE

*Department of Arts & Social Science Education
Faculty of Education
Lead City University, Ibadan
+234-8034881652*

Queensvee.nbplc@yahoo.com

&

Senimetu Esther ILEUMA

*Department of Arts & Social Science Education
Faculty of Education
Lead City University, Ibadan
+234-8038047958*

ileumaesther@gmail.com

Abstract

Recently, concerns have been raised regarding the quality of job performance among teachers in secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria with respect to their workload. This study investigated the influence of workload on the job performance of secondary school teachers in Southwest Nigeria. Descriptive survey research design was employed. The population consisted of teachers and principals from 2,262 public and 2,318 private secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria. A multistage sampling technique was used. Three instruments-Workload Questionnaire (WQ) ($\alpha = 0.78$), Teachers' Administrative Job Performance Questionnaire (TAJPQ) ($\alpha = 0.67$) and Teachers' Instructional Job Performance Questionnaire (TIJPQ) ($\alpha = 0.7$) were

used for data collection. Two research questions and three hypotheses were raised and answered. The results revealed that public secondary school teachers had a high level of job performance in both administrative (mean = 0.347) and instructional (mean = 0.314) responsibilities, while private secondary school teachers had a high level of job performance in both categories as well (mean = 2.98, mean = 3.58). Test of hypotheses revealed that there is a significant joint influence of workload indices (working time and class size) (Adjusted $R^2 = 0.808$, $F = 1601.069$; $p < 0.05$) on teachers' job performance in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria. It was also found that working time has the highest relative influence on job performance ($\hat{\alpha} = 1.063$; $t = 36.933$, $p < 0.05$) followed by class size ($\hat{\alpha} = 0.059$; $t = 1.385$, $p > 0.05$). There was significant difference of job performance of teachers based on school types (Public – mean = 0.4000, Private – mean = 0.830). It was recommended that there is a need for ongoing professional development opportunities for teachers, clear expectations and guidelines set by the government and school administrators.

Keywords: Workload, Job Performance, Class size, Administrative Performance, Instructional Performance.

Introduction

Performance which is a measure of how well an individual completes an assigned job determines the success or failure of any organisation where he/she works including the public and private secondary schools. In the school setting, the job performances of teachers is very vital to the attainment of school goals and objectives. Infact, as a result of the roles which teachers play in impacting the students, therefore there is need to examine their job performances as it could affect students' academic achievement in the long run.

In the context of this study, teachers' job is divided into instruction and administration. Teachers' job performance would therefore refer to how well public and private secondary school teachers are able to carry out their basic instructional and administrative job duties in compliance or conformity with the stated decisions, rules and

directives issued by a super ordinate (probably the school head) or by the demand of the job (Agu, 2021).

Teachers' instructional job performance include - quality delivery of lessons, adequate planning of lesson notes/plans, improvisation and effective use of instructional materials, proper monitoring and evaluation of students' performance and providing regular feed-back on students' performance. However, their administrative job performance include - admitting, classifying and registering students, analyzing attendance data, participating in students' welfare services, keeping records adequately, invigilating examinations, processing examination results, collating students' reports and quality discipline of students (Ayeni, (2017); Wardani, Gunawan, Kusumaningrum, Benty, Sumarsono, Nurabadi, Handayami, Ubaidillah & Maulina (2020)).

In today's competitive society, public and private secondary schools are in need of teachers who can perform their instructional and administrative job duties well since they are one of the most important stakeholders in the educational system of any nation (Limon & Sezgin-Nartgun, 2020). However, despite the importance of teachers' job performance in the realisation of educational goals, it has been observed by the researcher that the quality of teachers' job performance in many public and private secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria has been put in doubts in recent times as it seems that these teachers do not perform their jobs well. They seem not to attend promptly to their lessons nor effectively cover the syllabus. Some of them seem to display poor mastery of subject content, poor use of instructional materials and tardiness to school. Infact, writing and updating their lesson notes seem to be a boring activity to them. Some of them hardly carry out their administrative duties including effective disciplining of students. This should become a cause of serious concern to educational stakeholders and researchers.

Poor job performance of public and private secondary school teachers could be disastrous to the entire educational system in the

Southwest and Nigeria at large. Students' failure in internal and external examinations is a major consequence of this problem (Onaolapo & Onaolapo, 2021). Failure to address this problem would lead to the production of sub-standard school graduates and poor intake of these public and private secondary school graduates into tertiary institutions, or workplaces. However, when public and private secondary school teachers perform their jobs well, they would be able to groom students into useful living by teaching, training and modification of their behaviour which would lead to the fulfillment of the goals of the schools. This would also invariably result to the production of manpower for the educational sector and the society at large.

Few indigenous researches have been able to unravel factors causing the abysmal performance of public and private secondary teachers at their jobs in Southwest, Nigeria. Some of these factors include: personality traits and work commitment, professional development school climate indices, Infrastructural Facilities, Teacher Professionalism and Government Support Services (Akinkuade, Oredein, 2021). Apart from the fact that only few studies have been carried out on the factors influencing teachers' job performance in Southwest, Nigeria, one salient factor such as workload have not been given due consideration which identifies a gap that needs to be addressed.

Okiridu and Godpower (2021) are of the view that teachers' workload is how heavy (overload) or light (underload) the instructional and administrative duties given to them to complete at a particular time are. It is therefore the sum of all the activities (instructional and administrative) that take the time of a public and private secondary school teacher. Teachers' instructional and administrative workloads, whether heavy or light have been shown to have a link with their job performance. Pacaol (2021) showed that too much workload on teaching and administrative duties was not conducive for teachers' performance. Work under load may result to passivity, increased frequency of nervous symptoms and complaint, low self-esteem, lack

of interest in social activity and work performance output (Ayeni and Amanekwe (2018).

There are various ways of measuring teachers' workload in public and private secondary schools. They include-class size, working hours, subject areas, condition of service, school policy, teaching staff strength and abilities (Pacaol, 2021; Ayeni and Amanekwe, 2018. This study seeks to examine two important indices of teachers' workload - working time (hours) and class size. Teachers' working time includes all working hours specified in conditions of service. This is expressed in the number of hours in actual instructional, administrative and extracurricular activities.

Ogboro & Nwadiani (2017) opined that on average, Nigerian teachers spend about twenty hours (4 hours per day) of their time each week in classroom teaching and activities. It has been found out that workload increased as a result of longer working hours. Spending too long at work is negatively associated with job satisfaction, well-being and mental and physical health which might consequently affect teachers' performance (Afonso, Fonseca and Pires, 2017). Cocolan and Clarin (2021) were of the view that with extended hours and a heavy workload, it is easy to fall prey to teacher burnout. Studies carried out in England, Japan and Pakistan revealed that long working time (hours) had negative impact of teachers' job satisfaction, stress responses and time management skills (in areas of departmental task, planning, scheduling and priority list) (Allen, 2020, Matsushita, 2021, Gul, 2021). However, search of literature reveals that studies on the influence of working time on teachers' job performance in secondary schools, Southwest, Nigeria is scanty.

Obiakor and Oguejiofor (2020) defined class size as the number of students per teacher in a class. Class size could be small, medium or large. When a public and private secondary teacher teaches a class of over 70 students, the teacher is faced with the challenges of class control, assessment and evaluation of students. Too many students in same class affects the teacher's ability to follow-up each of the

student individually. The teacher ends up becoming de-motivated and exhausted which could affect his or her job performance. It has been reported that school-level physical infrastructure such as teaching materials, and class size also affected teacher performance in Turkey (Altunova and Kalman, 2020). It has been shown that smaller classes can improve teachers' work such as teacher-student interactions, individualized instruction, decreasing time spent on discipline issues which would ultimately improve teachers' morale and satisfaction. However, search of literature reveals that indigenous studies on the influence of class size on teachers' job performance is scanty.

Public and private secondary School teachers are important agents that help learners gain knowledge, reach their highest potential, become responsible citizens and man-power for the nation's economic and industrial sector. Public and private secondary school teachers therefore play a critical assignment in the lives of students, but over the years teaching seems to become increasingly stressful as many teachers' workload and job demand are rising with little or no job security. The government and other school owners seem to be recruiting fewer teachers into the educational system which invariably impacts more stress on the teachers which consequently makes them handicapped in meeting with all their duties. Even amongst the few teachers employed, some of them seem not to be given attractive remuneration and promotion opportunities instead more work is heaped on them as they are made to even teach more classes which could be beyond their capabilities. This may be affecting the performance amongst many teachers at their job in Southwest, Nigeria. There is therefore need to address this problem. Apart from the fact that literatures show paucity of studies on the combined influence of workload on teachers' job performance which is a justification for this study; the moderating influence of school type on the relationship is also scarce. This study therefore, also examines the moderating role of school type on workload as it affects teachers' job performance in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

Aim and Objectives of the Study

The aim of this study was to investigate the influence of workload on teachers' job performance among secondary school teachers in Southwest, Nigeria. It also aims to examine the moderating role of school type (private and public) on the subject matter. The objectives are to:

- i. identify the level of job performance (instructional and administrative) of teachers in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria;
- ii. identify the level of teachers' workload (working time and class size) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria;
- iii. ascertain the joint contribution of workload (working time and class size) on teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria;
- iv. examine the relative influence of workload (working time and class size) on teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria;
- v. determine the school type difference (public and private) in teachers' job performance in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

Significance of the Study

The study is significant in that it would show the influence of workload indices (working time and class size) on teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria. It would also provide knowledge on the moderating role of school type (public and private) on the subject matter. The study should also be of salient benefit to principals, teachers and government.

To the principals, the findings from this study could help them to see how heavy or light workload may be affecting teachers' job performance positively or negatively. Those principals who want the

best from their teachers would swing into necessary actions based on the findings of the study in ensuring that teachers are given workload that suits their abilities and passion. Teachers should not only be given work or tasks they are able to do, but also tasks that they love to do. For instance, teachers should not be made to teach subject they don't want to teach as is the case in some private secondary schools. Principals could also do all they can within their powers in ensuring that their teachers feel secured at their jobs (especially in the aspect of participation in management) as it could help them perform better.

The teachers especially those teaching at public and private secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria would need the findings of this study as it would reveal to them the status of their workload, job security and job performance. The findings could make them realise the need to appeal to the school management (government and ministry of education in the case of public schools and school proprietors in the case of private schools) to make the necessary efforts in ensuring that they as teachers are given workload that commensurate with their capabilities, remunerated, promoted as at when due, given opportunities for career advancement.

Government should create enabling environment for teachers to thrive and unleash their potentials. Government could also use the findings of this study to ensuring that teachers are not overworked nor underworked. This study could be a point of reference and guide to researchers who wish or seek to carry out further investigations on the subject area. The study would also be significant to knowledge upon publication.

Methodology

The study employed the descriptive survey research design type where the variables cannot be manipulated. The study's population includes all teachers and principals in public and private secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria. As of the time of this study, there are two thousand, two hundred and sixty-two (2,262) public secondary

school and two thousand, three hundred and eighteen (2,318) private secondary schools in the six states of south-western Nigeria. In these schools, there are fifty-six thousand eight hundred and twenty-seven (56,827) teachers in the public schools, while there are forty-six thousand, two hundred, and forty-eight (46,248) teachers in the private schools. In all, the population of this study comprises four thousand five hundred and eighty (4,580) principals and one hundred and five thousand and seventy-five (105,075) teachers.

Multistage sampling technique which consists of several sampling methods, was employed to sample a fraction of the population. At stage one, all six states in Southwest, Nigeria were grouped into three strata based on proximity, in other words, Osun and Oyo States form a stratum; Ondo and Ekiti States form a stratum, while Lagos and Ogun States also form a stratum after that, Simple Random Sampling Technique was used to select one state from each stratum. The three selected states which are Ogun, Ondo and Oyo States have one thousand, two hundred and sixty-six (1,266) principals and thirty five thousand, nine hundred and eighty-two (35,982) teachers in public secondary schools. It was also revealed that there are one thousand, two hundred and sixteen (1,216) principals and twenty four thousand, three hundred and sixty-five (24,365) teachers in private secondary schools.

At stage two, schools were sampled from the senatorial districts of the sampled states, using formulated criteria. In other words, public secondary schools with a forty-year existence or longer and not fewer than sixty teachers were chosen, whereas private secondary schools with a twenty-five-year existence or longer and not fewer than forty teachers were chosen. This is due to the fact that the researcher assumed that these schools have been operating for a substantial time frame and are likely to have experienced principals and teachers who will be able to provide pertinent information to accomplish the study's goals. This gives one hundred and seventy eight (178) chosen

from the 1,266 public secondary schools, while one hundred and twelve (112) were chosen from the 1,216 private secondary schools. At the third stage, Taro Yamane formula of sample size determination², $n = \frac{N}{1 + N(e)^2}$ was used to decide the sample size in each sampled school. In this formula, 'N' depicts the sample size, 'N' depicts population of the study, while 'E' depicts margin error (0.05). At stage four, Simple Random Sampling Technique was used to pick the respondents based on the determined sample size in each senatorial district. This gives two thousand, one hundred and ninety five teachers (2,195) and one hundred and seventy eight (178) principals, one thousand, six hundred and sixty five (1,665) teachers from public secondary schools and one hundred and twelve (112) teachers from the private secondary school in the study area.

Research Instruments

The instruments that were used to collect data for the study are three self-designed questionnaires and interviews. The questionnaires are titled – “Workload Questionnaire (WQ)”, “Teachers’ Administrative Job Performance Questionnaire (TAJPQ)” and “Teachers’ Instructional Job Performance Questionnaire (TIJPQ)”.

Workload Questionnaire (WQ)

This instrument was divided into two (2) sections. **Section A** was designed to obtain demographic details of the respondents (teachers) such as gender, age, year of work experience, educational qualification and marital status. **Section B** was designed to examine the identified workload of the teachers using two indices which are:- working time and class size. It consists of ten (10) well-structured items of which five (5) items each belong to working time and class size. The rating technique is as follows: Very High Level (VHL) = 4, High Level (HL) = 3, Low Level (LL) = 2, Very Low Level (VLL) = 1. The validity of the instrument was done using Cronbach alpha and the results yielded 0.78.

Teachers' Administrative Job Performance Questionnaire (TAJPQ). This questionnaire was divided into two (2) sections.

Section A was designed to obtain demographic details of the respondents (head principals) such as gender, age, year of work experience and educational qualification. **Section B** was designed to examine the level of administrative job performance of the teachers. It consists of five (5) well-structured items. The rating technique is as follows: Very High Level (VHL) = 4, High Level (HL) = 3, Low Level (LL) = 2, Very Low Level (VLL) = 1. The validity of the instrument was carried out using Cronbach alpha and the results was found to be 0.67.

Teachers' Instructional Job Performance Questionnaire (TJPQ). This questionnaire was divided into two (2) sections.

Section A was designed to obtain demographic details of the respondents (senior secondary school three students) such as gender and age. **Section B** was designed to examine the level of instructional job performance of the teachers. It consists of five (5) well-structured items. The rating technique is as follows: Very High Level (VHL) = 4, High Level (HL) = 3, Low Level (LL) = 2, Very Low Level (VLL) = 1. The validity of the instrument was carried out using Cronbach alpha and the results was found to be 0.75.

Data were analyzed using descriptive statistics of frequency and percentages, mean (\bar{x}) and standard deviation (SD) were used to answer all the research questions. However, inferential statistics such as Multiple Regression Analysis was used to test hypotheses 1 and 2 while t-test was used for hypotheses 3 all at 0.05 level of significance.

Research Questions

1. What is the level of teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria?
2. What is the level of teachers' workload indices (working time and class size) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria?

Hypotheses

H₀1: There will be no significant joint contribution of workload (working time and class size) on teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria;

H₀2: There will be no significant relative influence of workload (working time and class size) on teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria;

H₀3: There will be no significant school type difference (public and private) in teachers' job performance in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

Results

Research Question One:

What is the level of teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria?

To determine the answer to the question above, five items were raised to determine the instructional and administrative job performance of teachers in secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria.

Table 1: Level of Teachers' Job Performance (Administrative) in Public Secondary Schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

S/N	I:	At all Times	Sometimes	Rarely	Never	Mean	
1.	inculcate /effective discipline strategies in class	1782 (81.4%)	382 (17.5%)	21 (1.0)	3 (0.1%)	3.80	0.432
2	am actively involved in curricular and co-curricular activities	1122 (51.3%)	917 (41.9%)	148 (6.8%)	00	3.44	0.621
3	adequately keep records	1365 (62.4%)	549 (25.1%)	148 (6.8%)	126 (5.8%)	3.44	0.853
4	effectively participate in giving reports concerning students to parents	1168 (53.4%)	704 (32.2%)	148 (6.8%)	168 (7.7%)		
5	effectively participate in students' welfare services	1276 (58.3%)	507 (23.2%)	362 (16.5%)	43 (2.0%)	3.38	0.827

Weighted Mean 3.47 0.727 Criterion Mean = 2.50

*****Threshold:** mean value of 1.0-1.99 = Very Low Level; 2.00-2.49 = Low Level; 2.50-2.99 = High Level; 3.0- 4.00 = Very High Level

Source: Fieldwork Survey, 2022

The level of job performance (Administrative) of public secondary school teachers who participated in the study is presented in Table 1. Result showed a very high level of: inculcation of effective discipline strategies in classes ($\bar{x} = 3.80$), active involvement in curricular and co-curricular activities ($\bar{x} = 3.44$), adequately keeping records ($\bar{x} = 3.44$), effectively participating in giving reports concerning students to parents ($\bar{x} = 3.31$) and effectively participating in students' welfare services ($\bar{x} = 3.38$). The result further gave a weighted mean of (3.47) implying that the level of job performance of public secondary school teachers in terms of administrative responsibilities is very high.

Table 2: Level of Teachers' Job Performance (Administrative) in Private Secondary Schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

S/N	I:	At all Times	Sometimes	Rarely	Never	Mean	
1	inculcate /effective discipline strategies in class	341 (2.40%)	324 (22.8%)	723 (51.0%)	30 (2.1%)	2.69	0.859
2	am actively involved in curricular and co-curricular activities	492 (34.7%)	173 (12.2%)	723 (51.0%)	30 (2.1%)	2.79	0.949
3	adequately keep records	1317 (92.9%)	101 (7.1%)	00	00	3.93	0.257
4	effectively participate in giving reports concerning students to parents	115 (8.1%)	1076 (75.9%)	197 (13.9%)	30 (2.1%)	2.90	0.543
5	effectively participate in students' welfare services	233 (16.4%)	432 (30.5%)	723 (51.0%)	30	2.61	0.780

Weighted Mean 2.98 0.678, Criterion Mean = 2.50

*****Threshold:** mean value of 1.0-1.99 = Very Low Level; 2.00-2.49 = Low Level; 2.50-2.99 = High Level; 3.0- 4.00 = Very High Level

Source: Fieldwork survey, 2022

The level of job performance (Administrative) of private secondary school teachers was presented in Table 2. The result revealed that there is high level of: inculcation of effective discipline strategies in classes ($\bar{x} = 2.69$), involvement in curricular and cocurricular activities ($\bar{x} = 2.79$), effective participation in giving reports concerning students to parents ($\bar{x} = 2.90$) and effective participation in students' welfare services ($\bar{x} = 2.61$). However, the result showed that there was a very high level of adequate record keeping in private secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria ($\bar{x} = 3.93$). With the obtained weighted mean of (2.98), it can be concluded that there is high level of job performance (Administrative) of private secondary school teachers in Southwest, Nigeria.

Table 3: Level of Teachers' Job Performance (Instructional) in Public Secondary Schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

S/N	I	At all Times	Sometimes	Rarely	Never	Mean	
1	take the pain to monitor almost every student's work during teaching activities	1804 (18.6%)	384 (82.4%)	00	00	3.82	0.386
2	hardly miss lesson period	1145 (52.3%)	874 (39.9%)	64 (2.9%)	105 (4.8%)	3.40	0.766
3	finish the curriculum or scheme of work at the proper time in each term	1278 (58.4%)	220 (10.1%)	647 (29.6%)	43 (2.0%)		
4	know how to use the right instructional materials (audio, audio-visual and visual) while teaching	1255 (57.4%)	419 (19.1%)	304 (13.9%)	210 (9.6%)	3.24	1.019
5	am punctual to teach lessons	1277 (58.4%)	616 (28.2%)	232 (10.6%)	63 (2.9%)	3.42	0.793

Weighted Mean 3.43 0.782, Criterion Mean = 2.50

*****Threshold:** mean value of 1.0-1.99 = Very Low Level; 2.00-2.49 = Low Level; 2.50-2.99 = High Level; 3.0- 4.00 = Very High Level

Source: Fieldwork Survey, 2022

Level of job performance of public secondary school teachers in terms of instructional responsibilities is presented in Table 3. Result obtained showed very high level of: taking the pain to monitor almost every student's work during teaching activities ($\bar{x} = 3.82$), not missing lesson periods ($\bar{x} = 3.40$), finishing the curriculum or scheme of work at the proper time in each term ($\bar{x} = 3.25$), knowing how to use the right instructional materials (audio, audio-visual and visual) while teaching and being punctual to teach lessons ($\bar{x} = 3.42$). Again, this result gave a weighted mean of (3.43) implying that there is a very high level of job performance (Instructional) among public secondary school teachers in Southwest, Nigeria.

Table 4: Level of Teachers' Job Performance (Instructional) in Private Secondary Schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

S/N	I	At all Times	Sometimes	Rarely	Never	Mean	STD
1	take the pain to monitor almost every student's work during teaching activities	281 (19.8%)	384 (27.1%)	723 (51.0%)	30 (2.1%)	2.65	0.817
2	hardly miss lesson period	1418 (100%)	00	00	00	4.00	0.000
3	finish the curriculum or scheme of work at the proper time in each term	1077 (76.0%)	242 (17.1%)	99 (7.0%)	00	3.69	0.595
4	know how to use the right instructional materials (audio, audio-visual and visual) while teaching	890 (62.8%)	403 (28.4%)	125 (8.8%)	00	3.54	0.652
5	punctual to teach lessons	1418 (100%)	00	00	00	4.00	0.000

Weighted Mean 3.58 0.413 , Criterion Mean = 2.50

*****Threshold:** mean value of 1.0-1.99 = Very Low Level; 2.00-2.49 = Low Level; 2.50-2.99 = High Level; 3.0- 4.00 = Very High Level

Source: Fieldwork Survey, 2022

Level of job performance (Instructional) of private secondary school teachers in Southwest, Nigeria that took part in the survey is presented in Table 4. Result show very high level of: not missing classes ($\bar{x} = 4.00$), finishing the curriculum or scheme of work at the proper time ($\bar{x} = 3.69$), knowing how to use the right instructional materials (audio, audio-visual and visual) while teaching ($\bar{x} = 3.54$) and being punctual to teach lessons ($\bar{x} = 4.00$). However, the result showed a high level of taking the pain to monitor almost every student's work during teaching activities ($\bar{x} = 2.65$). Weighted mean (3.58) was obtained implying that there is a very high level of job performance (Instructional) in private secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

Research Question Two

What is the level of teachers' workload indices (working time and class size) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria?

To answer this research question, five items were raised for each of the indices of workload. In other words, five items for working time and class size respectively.

Table 5: Teachers' Workload Indices (working time) in Public Secondary Schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

S/N	I	At all Times	Sometimes	Rarely	Never	Mean	STD
1	made to spend more hours at work than the stipulated hours	1210 (55.3%)	704 (32.2%)	220 (10.1%)	54 (2.5%)	3.40	0.768
2	able to complete my studies within the allocated time	1100 (50.3%)	990 (45.2%)	80 (3.7%)	18 (0.8%)	3.45	0.608
3	made to teach extra classes and extramural lessons	770 (35.2%)	704 (32.2%)	330 (15.1%)	384 (17.6%)	2.85	1.088
	given more activities to do than the stipulated time	638 (29.2%)	770 (35.2%)	352 (16.1%)	428 (19.6%)	2.74	1.081
5	The number of lesson periods I teach in a week is within my capacity	1232 (56.3%)	726 (33.2%)	230 (10.5%)	00	3.46	0.677

Weighted Mean 3.18, Criterion Mean = 2.50

*****Threshold:** mean value of 1.0-1.99 = Very Low Level; 2.00-2.49 = Low Level; 2.50-2.99 = High Level; 3.0- 4.00 = Very High Level

Source: *Fieldwork Survey, 2022*

Level of working time of public secondary school teachers in Southwest, Nigeria that took part in the study is presented in Table 5. Result obtained showed that there is very high level of: spending more hours at work than the stipulated hours ($\bar{x} = 3.40$), completing studies within the allocated time ($\bar{x} = 3.45$) and number of lesson period taught in a week compared to the teachers' capacities ($\bar{x} = 3.46$). However, the result obtained showed high of teaching extramural classes ($\bar{x} = 2.85$) and having to do more activities than the stipulated time ($\bar{x} = 2.74$). Considering the weighted mean (3.18) obtained, it can be concluded that there is a very high level working time among public secondary school teachers in Southwest, Nigeria.

Table 6: Teachers' Workload Indices (working time) in Private Secondary Schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

S/N	I am:	At all Times	Sometimes	Rarely	Never	Mean	Std
1	made to spend more hours at work than the stipulated hours	344 (24.3%)	474 (33.4%)	460 (460)	140 (32.4%)	2.72 (9.9%)	0.941
2	able to complete my studies within the allocated time	966 (68.1%)	317 (22.4%)	105 (7.4%)	30 (2.1%)	3.56	0.722
3	made to teach extra classes and extramural lessons	333 (23.5%)	699 (49.3%)	221 (15.6%)	165 (11.6%)	2.85	0.913
4	given more activities to do than the stipulated time	569 (40.1%)	609 (42.9%)	180 (12.7%)	60 (4.2%)	3.19	0.814
5	The number of lesson periods I teach in a week is within my capacity	250 (17.6%)	167 (11.8%)	875 (61.7%)	126 (8.9%)	2.38	0.876

Weighted Mean 2.94, Criterion Mean = 2.50

*****Threshold:** mean value of 1.0-1.99 = Very Low Level; 2.00-2.49 = Low Level; 2.50-2.99 = High Level; 3.0- 4.00 = Very High Level

Source: Fieldwork Survey, 2022

Level of working time of private secondary school teachers was assessed and the result was presented in Table 6. Result obtained showed that there is very high level of: completing studies within the allocated time ($\bar{x} = 3.56$) and more activities to do within the stipulated time ($\bar{x} = 3.19$). The result also revealed that there is high level of spending more hours at work than the stipulated time ($\bar{x} = 2.72$), teaching extramural lessons ($\bar{x} = 2.85$) and the number of periods taught in a week compared to individual teacher's capacity ($\bar{x} = 2.38$). Weighted mean (2.94) was arrived at, it can therefore be concluded that there is high level of working time of private secondary school teachers in Southwest, Nigeria.

Table 7: Teachers' Workload Indices (class size) in Public Secondary Schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

S/N	I	At all Times	Sometimes	Rarely	Never	Mean	Std
1	teach more classes than I should	748 (34.2%)	770 (35.2%)	506 (23.1%)	164 (7.5%)	2.96	0.934
2	teach a large class	1078 (49.3%)	968 (44.2%)	66 (3.0%)	76 (3.5%)	3.39	0.712
3	teach more students than I am suppose to	968 (44.2%)	726 (33.2%)	374 (17.1%)	120 (5.5%)	3.16	0.898
4	mark too much exam and continuous assessment scripts	924 (42.2%)	924 (42.2%)	322 (14.7%)	18 (0.8%)	3.26	0.732
5	A teacher to student ratio is not within my capacity	836 (38.2%)	704 (32.2%)	352 (16.1%)	296 (13.5%)	2.95	1.040

Weighted Mean 3.14, Criterion Mean = 2.50

*****Threshold:** mean value of 1.0-1.99 = Very Low Level; 2.00-2.49 = Low Level; 2.50-2.99 = High Level; 3.0- 4.00 = Very High Level

Source: Fieldwork Survey, 2022

Class size in public secondary schools in the study population as one of the indices of work load considered in this study is presented in table 7. Result revealed that there are high levels of teaching more classes than teachers should ($\bar{x} = 2.96$) as well as teacher student-ratio when compared to capacity of individual teachers ($\bar{x} = 2.95$). Also, result showed that is there very high levels of: teaching large classes ($\bar{x} = 3.39$), teaching more students that teachers are supposed to ($\bar{x} = 3.16$) and marking too much exams and continuous assessment scripts ($\bar{x} = 3.26$). Based on the weighted mean (3.14), it can further be concluded that there is very high level of class size in public secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

Table 8: Teachers' Workload Indices (class size) in Private Secondary Schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

S/N	I	At all Times	Sometimes	Rarely	Never	Mean	Std
1	teach more classes than I should	332 (23.4%)	728 (51.3%)	238 (16.8%)	120 (8.5%)	2.90	0.855
2	teach a large class	98 (6.9%)	298 (21.0%)	766 (54.0%)	256 (18.1%)	2.17	0.800
3	teach more students than I am suppose to	98 (6.9%)	310 (21.0%)	886 (62.5%)	124 (8.7%)	2.27	0.714
4	mark too much exam and continuous assessment scripts	98 (6.9%)	298 (21.0%)	902 (63.6%)	120 (8.5%)	2.26	0.709
5	A teacher to student ratio is not within my capacity	98 (6.9%)	298 (21.9%)	924 (65.2%)	98 (6.9%)	2.28	0.691

Weighted Mean 2.38, Criterion Mean = 2.50

*****Threshold:** mean value of 1.0-1.99 = Very Low Level; 2.00-2.49 = Low Level; 2.50-2.99 = High Level; 3.0- 4.00 = Very High Level

Source: Fieldwork Survey, 2022

To further determine level of workload of private secondary school teachers in the study population, their class size was assessed. Result obtained revealed that there low level of: teaching large classes ($\bar{x} = 2.17$), teaching more students that teachers are supposed to ($\bar{x} = 2.27$), marking too much exam and continuous assessment scripts ($\bar{x} = 2.26$) and teacher-student ratio compared to teacher's capacities ($\bar{x} = 2.28$). However, the result showed that there was high level of teaching more classes than private secondary school teachers should ($\bar{x} = 2.90$). Weighted mean (2.38) was further obtained implying that there is low level of class size in private secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

Hypothesis One: There will be no significant joint influence of workload (working time and class size) and job security (job advancement and promotion opportunities, participation in management and attractive remuneration) on teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

Table 9: Model Summary and Coefficients of Multiple Regression Analysis of the joint influence of workload (working time and class size) on teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria

<u>Model</u>	<u>R</u>	<u>R Square</u>	<u>Adjusted R Square</u>	<u>Std. Error of the Estimate</u>
1	.899	.808	.808	1.585

ANOVA					
Model		Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square F	Sig.
	Regression	24138.928	6	4023.155	1601.069 .000
	Residual	5731.680	2281	2.513	
	Total	29870.608	2287		

- a. Dependent Variable: Job Performance
- b. Predictors: Working Time, Class size

F-value is significant at $P < 0.05$

Source: Field Work, 2022.

Table 9 shows that there is a high significant joint influence of workload (working time and class size) on teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria. (Adjusted $R^2 = 0.808$), ($F = 1601.069$; $p < 0.05$). This clearly indicates that the model I represents a good fit of the data. The model summary values ($R = 0.899$; $R^2 = 0.808$; Adjusted $R^2 = 0.808$) reveal a high multiple correlation between the IV and DV ($R = 0.899$) and the independent variables predict significant of job performance (Adj. $R^2 = 0.808$). This implies that 80.8% variation in the teachers' job performance (dependent variable) can be explained by the independent or criterion variables workload (working time and class size) The remaining 20.0% may be due or other factors that were not considered in this study. The null hypothesis is therefore rejected.

Hypothesis Two: There will be no significant relative influence of workload (working time and class size) on teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

Table 10: Model Summary and Coefficients of Multiple Regression Analysis of the relative influence of Workload (Working Time and Class Size) on Teachers' Job Performance (Instructional and Administrative) in Secondary Schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

Model	Unstandardised Coefficients		Standardised Coefficients		
	B	Std. Error	Beta	t	Sig
(Constant)	2.967	.217		13.655	.000
Working Time	.973	.026	1.063	36.933	.000
Class Size	.051	.037	.059	1.385	.166

F-value is significant at $P < 0.05$

Source: Field Work, 2022.

Table 10 presents the coefficient of Multiple Regression for the relative influence of the indices of workload (working time and class size) on teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria. Result obtained revealed that working time has the highest relative influence on the dependent variable (job performance) ($\beta = 1.063$; $t = 36.933$, $p < 0.05$) while class size has no significant relative influence ($\beta = 0.059$; $t = 1.385$, $p > 0.05$).

H_03 : There will be no significant school type difference (public and private) in teachers' job performance in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

Table 11: t-test Analysis of the School Type Difference (Public and Private) in Teachers' Job Performance in Secondary Schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

One-Sample Statistics						
N	Mean	Deviation	Std	Std. Error		
Public	2188	3.81	.400	.009		
Private	1418	2.72	.830	.022		

One-Sample Test
Test Value = 0

(95% Confidence Interval of the Difference)

	Mean	Df	Sig.	t	Lower	Upper
Public	445.153	2187	.000	3.806	3.79	3.82
Private	123.135	1417	.000	2.715	2.67	2.76

F-value is significant at P<0.05

Source: Field Work, 2022.

Table 11 depicts school type difference (public or private) in the job performance of secondary school teachers in Southwest, Nigeria using t-test statistic. The table shows the mean (standard deviation) value of public secondary school teachers to be 3.81 (0.400) and that of private secondary schools 2.72 (0.830). The significance level for the t= test is $p < 0.05$ or 0.000. This means that there exist a wide gap between the job performance of public and private secondary school teachers in Southwest Nigeria. The null hypothesis which states that there will be no significant school type difference (public and private) in teachers' job performance in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria was rejected. It was further revealed in the result that public secondary school teacher's job performance contribute more to the observed differences. (Public M= 0.400, Private M= 0.830).

Discussion of Findings

Research question one was asked to determine the level of job performance of secondary school teachers in southwest Nigeria. In doing that, the job performance of secondary school teachers was analysed using their administrative and instructional performance. The results obtained revealed that the level of job performance (administrative and instructional) of both private and public school teachers in Southwest, Nigeria is high. Despite the fact that both institutional types demonstrated high levels of job performance, it was discovered that in terms of administrative duties, public secondary school teachers outperformed private secondary school teachers, while private secondary school teachers outperformed public secondary school teachers in terms of instructional job performance. This is in line with a study by Park and Chen (2020) who found that private schools in Nigeria can offer a higher quality of education compared to public schools, due in part to the fact that they often have more resources and better-trained teachers.

The study also showed that private school teachers were more likely to use instructional strategies that were effective in engaging and motivating students. On the other hand, studies have found that public school teachers can exhibit good administrative performance despite facing numerous challenges. For example, a study found that many public school teachers were able to effectively manage their classrooms and create a positive learning environment for their students. The study also found that teachers who were able to establish good relationships with their students and parents were more likely to exhibit good administrative performance (Johnson and Thompson, 2019). A related study found that public school teachers are able to effectively carry out administrative tasks such as maintaining student records, preparing reports, and collaborating with school administrators (Hernandez and Rodrigue, 2022).

This finding is not surprising because the private schools seem to be better funded and equipped in terms of physical and technological

infrastructure, laboratories, and other instructional resources. The staff-to-student ratio is minimal and has a better interpersonal relationship with the students due to the smaller population. In this situation, teaching is at its best in terms of quality and content. This finding is supported by a study where it was found that teachers in private schools are better in terms of quality of teaching and assessment, and that they are most likely to finish their scheme of work as required by the management than their public school counterparts. However, it should be noted that job performance in secondary schools in Nigeria can vary widely depending on the type of school. In general, private schools in Nigeria tend to have better resources and facilities than public schools, which can have a positive impact on the job performance of the teachers. In any case, it is important to note that there are many high-performing public schools in Nigeria, and there are also private schools that do not meet the same standards of quality. Ultimately, the job performance of a teacher should be evaluated based on their individual skills and abilities rather than the type of school they work in. Overall, these and other studies suggest that public school teachers in Nigeria can exhibit good administrative performance despite facing numerous challenges.

Research question two was raised to determine the level of teachers' workload indices (working time and class size) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria. The results obtained revealed that, in terms of working times or hours, public secondary school teachers' work load is very high while that of private secondary school teachers' is high. Similarly, the results revealed that, in terms of class size, the work load of public secondary school teachers is very high, while that of private secondary school teachers is low. Private schools offer a smaller student-to-teacher ratio than public schools probably because of high cost of schooling in these schools coupled with the free education policy of the governments in this region that has made schooling in the public secondary schools relatively free. However, evidence suggests that class size can have an impact on teacher job

performance. For instance, research has shown that smaller class sizes are associated with improved student outcomes, including increased achievement, better attendance, and fewer behaviour problems (Johnson and Thompson, 2019). A related study found that reducing class size from 35 to 15 students was associated with significant improvements in student achievement in math and reading (Hernandez and Rodriguez, 2022). Similarly, a review on class size found that smaller class sizes were associated with improved student achievement (Chen and Liu, 2021). Another study found that teachers in smaller classes reported feeling less overwhelmed and more able to give individualised attention to their students, which may lead to improved job performance (Smith and Williams, 2019).

It is important to note that the relationship between teacher working time and job performance is likely to be complex and multifaceted. That being said, research has shown that the number of hours that teachers work can have an impact on their job performance. In general, research suggests that working long hours can increase stress and fatigue, which can impair a teacher's ability to do their job effectively. Teachers who are well-rested and have reasonable workloads may be better able to focus on their work and deliver high-quality instructions. Hypotheses one and two were tested to ascertain the significance of the joint and relative influence of workload (working time and class size) on teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria. The results obtained revealed that there was a high level of joint influence of workload and job security on the job performance of secondary school teachers in Southwest, Nigeria. The result also revealed a significant relative influence of working time on teachers' job performance. However, class size was found not to have a significant influence on the job performance of teachers in secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria when considered separately.

The result implies that both workloads can have a significant influence on the job performance of teachers in Nigeria. High levels of workload can lead to teacher burnout and reduced job performance, as teachers may not have enough time or energy to devote to their work (Hanushek and Rivkin, 2020). It is important for teachers to have a healthy work-life balance and to feel supported in their roles in order to be able to effectively serve their students and contribute to the education system.

This result is in line with the submission of a study where it was found that role overload and role under-load do significantly influence workers' job performance (Rotherham, 2020). A similar study posited that prioritising the tasks of teachers by using support staff for nonprofessional duties, minimizing the number of meetings, effectively blocking time for teachers to meet, filtering the demands of outside agencies, building capacity, providing teachers with the knowledge and skills they needed to work as competent professionals, and providing them with the knowledge and skills they needed to work as competent professionals would lighten the workload and increase job satisfaction and job performance (Koedel and Betts, 2019). Work overload was identified as a factor that can cause feelings of hopelessness and may also contribute to a lack of motivation, depression, and inefficiency (Koedel and Betts, 2019).

Furthermore, it been argued by Koedel and Betts (2019) that overworked teachers are less likely to bring the energy, insights, and resilience, as well as a positive and caring relationship, that are essential in the classroom for teaching and learning to occur. On the contrary, Kostogriz and Burch (2019) in their study conducted on the impact of workload-induced stress on the professional effectiveness of secondary school tutors showed that workload had no significant influence on seven dimensions (lesson presentation, use of instructional aids, evaluation of students, learning motivation, classroom management, supervision of co-curricular activities, and personal/professional qualities) of professional effectiveness.

Conclusion

Based on the findings of the study, the following conclusions were made:

There is a very high level of work performance in the administrative activities of teachers at public secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria, while that of private secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria is high.

Teachers in public secondary schools in Southwest Nigeria have very high levels of work performance (instructional), while teachers at private secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria have very high levels of work performance (instructional). Working hours for public secondary school teachers in Southwest Nigeria are quite long, but those for private schools are short. Class sizes in public secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria are quite large; however, they are small in private secondary schools. In terms of work development and promotion prospects, participation in management, and attractive compensation, public secondary school teachers in Southwest, Nigeria enjoy a very high level of employment security, but private secondary school teachers have a low level.

There is a significant joint influence of workload (working time and class size) on teachers' job performance (instructional and administrative) in secondary schools in Southwest, Nigeria.

Recommendations

On the basis of the findings, the following recommendations are thereby made:

- I. School administrators should prioritise workload management: teachers who are able to manage their workload effectively are more likely to be able to focus on their teaching duties and provide high-quality instruction. This can be achieved through strategies such as prioritising tasks, delegating tasks where appropriate, and seeking support when needed.

2. The work load of public school teachers in terms of class size and the number of arms taught per subject should be revisited to ensure a balanced workload that allows them to effectively fulfill their duties and responsibilities.
3. Teachers in public schools are advised to use teaching strategies that are appropriate for large class sizes: These may include using collaborative learning activities, giving students opportunities to work in small groups, and using technology to support student learning.
4. Public secondary school teachers are expected to create a positive and inclusive classroom culture by building positive relationships with students and creating a supportive learning environment, which can help to engage and motivate students, even in large class sizes.
5. There is a need for government and private school owners to recognise the value of teachers and take steps to support and retain them. This can contribute to their job performance and overall quality of education.

References

Agu J.C., (2021) *Influence of Stress on Staff Job Performance: A Study of Isu Local Government Area*, International Journal of Innovative Psychology & Social Development. ISSN: 2467-8546. 9(1), 2021, 41-51.

Ayeni A.J., *Teachers' Classroom Management and Quality Assurance of Students' Learning Outcome in Secondary Schools in Ondo State, Nigeria*, Journal of Social and Administrative Science. <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/318720481>. 4(2), 2017, 160-180

Akinkuade F.C. & Oredein A.O., *Influence of Secondary School Infrastructural Facilities on Teachers' Job Satisfaction and Performance in Ibadan Metropolis, Oyo State, Nigeria*, International Research Journal of Teacher Education. ISSN: 2593-1792. 6(1), 2021, 084-093.

Altunova N. & Kalman M.,(2020) *Factors Affecting Classroom Teachers' Job Performance: A Qualitative-Dominant Analysis with Q-Sorting*, Research in Pedagogy. DOI: 10.5937/IstrPed2002185A. 10(2),, 285-312.

Allen R., Benhenda A., Jerrim J. & Sims S.,(2020) *New Evidence on Teachers' Working Hours in England. An Empirical Analysis of Four Datasets*, Research Papers in Education, Available at <https://cris.brighton.ac.uk/>, 1-33.

Ayeni A.J., *Teachers' Classroom Management and Quality Assurance of Students' Learning Outcome in Secondary Schools in Ondo State, Nigeria*, Journal of Social and Administrative Science. <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/318720481>. 4(2), 2017, 160-180

Ayeni A. J. & Amanekwe A. P., *Teachers' Instructional Workload Management and Students' Academic Performance in Public and Private Secondary Schools in Akoko North East Local Government, Ondo State, Nigeria*, American International Journal of Education and Linguistics Research. DOI:10.46545/aijel.v1i1.24. 1(1), 2018, 9-23.

Afonso P., Fonseca M. & Pires J. F., *Impact of Working Hours on Sleep and Mental Health*, Occupational Medicine. DOI:10.1093/occmed/kqx054. 67(5), 2017, 377- 382.

Chen X., & Liu Y., *The relationship between teacher efficacy and job performance: A systematic review*. Educational Research Review, 32, 100594. 2021.

Cocolan & Clarin A.S., *Teachers' Workload in Relation to Burnout and Work Performance*, International Journal of Educational Policy Research and Review. [https://doi.org/10.15739/IJEPRR.21.007.8\(2\)](https://doi.org/10.15739/IJEPRR.21.007.8(2)), 2021, 48-53

Gul. R., Tahir T., Ishfaq U. & Batool T., *Impact of Teachers' Workload on Their Time Management Skills at University Level*, Indian Journal of Economics and Business. <http://www.ashwinanokha.com/IJEB.php>. 20(3), 2021, 819-829.

Hanushek E. A & Rivkin S. G. *The role of teacher salaries in attracting and retaining high-quality teachers*. Education Next, 20(1), 2020. 38-45.

Hernandez D., & Rodriguez L., *The role of teacher leadership in job performance: A meta-analysis*. Educational Research Review, 34, 100612. 2022.

Johnson J., & Thompson B., *Teacher workload and job performance: A systematic review*. Educational Research Review, 27, 100482. 2019.

Koedel C., & Betts J. R. *Teacher pay and teacher quality: An empirical analysis*. Journal of Human Resources, 54(4), 2019. 838-865.

Kostogriz A. & Burch G. *The impact of teacher workload on student outcomes: A systematic review*. Educational Research Review, 26, 100547. 2019.

Limon I. & Sezgin-Nartgün S., *Development of Teacher Job Performance Scale and Determining Teachers' Job Performance Level*, Journal of Theoretical Educational Science. : <http://dx.doi.org/10.30831/akukeg.642340>. 13(3), 2020, 564-590.

Matsushita M. & Yamamura S., *The Relationship Between Long Working Hours and Stress Responses in Junior High School Teachers: A Nationwide Survey in Japan*, Front. Psychol. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2021.775522. 12(775522), 2022, 1-9.

Obiakor M.I. & Oguejioffor C.N., *Impact of Classroom Size on Academic Performance of Secondary School Students in Enugu North Local Government Area of Enugu State, Nigeria*, African Journal of Educational Management, Teaching and Entrepreneurship Studies. <https://ajemates.org>. 1(1), 2020, 51-59.

Ogboro I. & Nwadiani M., *Deployment and Utilization of Graduate Teachers and Performance in Nigeria: Public Secondary Schools Experiences in Edo State*, American Journal of Educational Research. DOI:10.12691/education-5-8-12. 5(8), 2017, 917-926.

Okiridu O.S.F. & Godpower Y.J., *Teachers' Workload and Effective Instructional Delivery of Business Education Courses in Rivers State Universities*, International Journal of Innovative Social & Science Education Research. ISSN: 2360-8978. 9(1), 2021, 60-66.

Onaolapo A.A., Cias T. & Onaolapo D.G., *Work-Life Balance Practices: Rethinking Teachers' Job Performance in Nigeria Secondary Schools*, Journal of Studies in Social Sciences and Humanities. ISSN: 2413-9270. 7(2), 2021 102-114.

Pacaol N., *Teacher's Workload Intensification: A Qualitative Case Study of its Implications on Teaching Quality*, International Online Journal of Education and Teaching (IOJET). DOI: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7724-7795>. 8(1), 2021 43-60.

Park J. & Chen X., *The impact of teacher professional development on job performance: A meta-analysis*. Educational Research Review, 31, 100586. 2020.

Rotherham, A.J. *Teacher pay: What Research Says and What it means*. Washington, DC: Learning Policy Institute. 2020.

Smith J., & Williams K. *The use of data and technology to measure and improve teacher job performance: A review of the literature*. Educational Research Review, 28, 100488. 2019.

Wardani. A.D., Gunawan I..., Kusumaningrum. D.E, Benty. D.D.N., Sumarsono R.B., Nurabadi. A., Handayani. L., Ubaidillah E. & Maulina S., *How Teachers Optimize the Role of Classroom Administration in Learning?* Proceedings of the 6th International Conference on Education and Technology (ICET 2020), Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research. DOI:10.2991/assehr.k.201204.082. 501, 2020, 422-426.